# MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE

## Rating Action: Moody's upgrades CMS and Consumers, outlook stable

Global Credit Research - 18 Apr 2017

#### Approximately \$9.8 billion of debt and credit facilities affected

New York, April 18, 2017 -- Moody's Investors Service upgraded the ratings of CMS Energy Corporation (CMS, senior unsecured to Baa1 from Baa2), and its electric and gas utility subsidiary Consumers Energy Company (Consumers, senior unsecured shelf to (P) A2 from (P) A3), and revised the outlook for both issuers to stable. Concurrently, consistent with the improved credit quality of Consumers, we have upgraded its short term rating for commercial paper to P-1.

#### RATINGS RATIONALE

"Today's upgrades recognize the continued strong financial performance that has been demonstrated by both Consumers and CMS as the companies invest meaningfully in their systems while controlling costs and benefiting from a supportive relationship with their regulator" said Laura Schumacher, Vice President - Senior Credit Officer. The upgrades consider ongoing modest deleveraging that is slowly reducing CMS consolidated debt and bringing its holding company debt to a level that, while still substantial, is commensurate with some other utility families with similar ratings. The upgrades also consider the relative position of credit metrics and ratings of both CMS and Consumers vis-à-vis those of their peer companies, including the other major rated Michigan utility family, DTE Energy Company (Baa1, stable) and its subsidiaries DTE Electric Company (A2, stable).

The ratings of CMS and Consumers reflect the above average regulatory environment in which Consumers operates and the resulting stable and predictable consolidated cash flows that are produced by the consolidated entity. The ratings recognize the limited business risk that exists within the family as over 90% of CMS' earnings and cash flow is generated by Consumers. A combination of supportive regulation and a continued focus on cost containment and efficiency has resulted in cash flow credit metrics that have been consistently strong. For example Consumer's ratio of cash from operations excluding changes in working capital (CFO pre-WC) to debt is around 25% while CMS's ratio is around 17%. These metrics are squarely within the respective "A" and "Baa" scoring ranges for these factors in our rating methodology for regulated electric and gas utilities. In calculating the CMS ratio we have excluded the debt (certificates of deposit) and cash flow associated with EnerBank, CMS' relatively small, self-funding, FDIC insured, industrial bank subsidiary that does not contribute meaningfully to its consolidated financial performance.

The upgrades reflect CMS' progress in slowly reducing its consolidated leverage position, and our expectation that this trend will continue. As of year-end 2016, we calculate CMS' consolidated debt to capital ratio at about 59%. The ratio has been declining by about 1% per year, and by 2021 we expect it will move into the 55% range. The percentage of parent holding company debt in CMS consolidated capital structure has also been slowly moderating. As of December 2016, including our standard analytical adjustments, we estimate CMS' holding company debt represented about 26% of its consolidated capital structure (inclusive of EnerBank obligations), or about 29% of total Consumers and CMS holding company debt. While this level of parent company debt is still significant, and a key driver of the two notch rating differential between CMS and Consumers senior unsecured ratings, it is in line with some other, similarly rated utility families.

#### Outlook

The stable outlook for CMS and Consumers reflects our expectation of a continued steady financial performance due in large part to a constructive legislative and above average regulatory environment in Michigan. The outlook also incorporates our view that the companies will maintain prudent financial policies with a focus on cost containment such that, at CMS, the ratio of CFO pre-W/C to debt will remain in the mid-to-high teens; and at Consumers, the ratio of CFO pre-W/C to debt will remain in the range of 25%. We also expect that consolidated debt to capital will continue to trend modestly downward.

### Factors that Could Lead to an Upgrade

An increase in sustainable cash flow or a reduction in leverage resulting in strengthening credit metrics, for

example at Consumers, a ratio of CFO pre-WC to debt remaining above 25%, and at CMS, above 20%; a reduction in CMS' parent holding company debt; or if the Michigan regulatory environment were to become even more formulaic, transparent or timely with its suite of recovery mechanisms.

Factors that Could Lead to a Downgrade

A material deterioration in Michigan's regulatory support, or a reduction in cash flow or increase in leverage that results in a sustained decline in credit metrics. For example, at Consumers, CFO pre-WC to debt falling to the high-teens, at CMS, CFO pre-WC to debt falling below the high-teens. An increase in CMS holding company debt could also put pressure on the ratings.

Upgrades:

Issuer: CMS Energy Corporation

- ....Senior Unsecured Shelf, Upgraded to (P)Baa1 from (P)Baa2
- ....Senior Secured Bank Credit Facility, Upgraded to A3 from Baa1
- ....Senior Unsecured Regular Bond/Debenture, Upgraded to Baa1 from Baa2

Issuer: Consumers Energy Company

- ....Senior Unsecured Shelf, Upgraded to (P)A2 from (P)A3
- ....Senior Secured Shelf, Upgraded to (P)Aa3 from (P)A1
- ....Underlying Senior Secured Regular Bond/Debenture, Upgraded to Aa3 from A1
- ....Senior Secured Regular Bond/Debenture, Upgraded to Aa3 from A1
- ....Pref. Stock Preferred Stock, Upgraded to A3 from Baa1
- ....Senior Secured Bank Credit Facility, Upgraded to Aa3 from A1
- ....Senior Secured First Mortgage Bonds, Upgraded to Aa3 from A1
- ....Senior Unsecured Commercial Paper, Upgraded to P-1 from P-2

**Outlook Actions:** 

- Issuer: CMS Energy Corporation
- ....Outlook, Changed To Stable From Positive

Issuer: Consumers Energy Company

....Outlook, Changed To Stable From Positive

CMS Energy Corporation (CMS) is an energy holding company whose principal subsidiary, Consumers Energy Company (Consumers), is a Michigan regulated electric and gas utility representing over 90% of CMS' earnings and cash flow. In addition to Consumers, CMS holds interests in 1,177 gross MW of unregulated, primarily natural gas-fired, generation located mostly within Michigan, and EnerBank, a FDIC-insured industrial bank providing unsecured consumer installment loans for financing home improvements.

The principal methodology used in these ratings was Regulated Electric and Gas Utilities published in December 2013. Please see the Rating Methodologies page on www.moodys.com for a copy of this methodology.

#### REGULATORY DISCLOSURES

For ratings issued on a program, series or category/class of debt, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to each rating of a subsequently issued bond or note of the same series or category/class of debt or pursuant to a program for which the ratings are derived exclusively from existing ratings in accordance with Moody's rating practices. For ratings issued on a support provider, this

announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the credit rating action on the support provider and in relation to each particular credit rating action for securities that derive their credit ratings from the support provider's credit rating. For provisional ratings, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the provisional rating assigned, and in relation to a definitive rating that may be assigned subsequent to the final issuance of the debt, in each case where the transaction structure and terms have not changed prior to the assignment of the definitive rating in a manner that would have affected the rating. For further information please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page for the respective issuer on www.moodys.com.

For any affected securities or rated entities receiving direct credit support from the primary entity(ies) of this credit rating action, and whose ratings may change as a result of this credit rating action, the associated regulatory disclosures will be those of the guarantor entity. Exceptions to this approach exist for the following disclosures, if applicable to jurisdiction: Ancillary Services, Disclosure to rated entity, Disclosure from rated entity.

Regulatory disclosures contained in this press release apply to the credit rating and, if applicable, the related rating outlook or rating review.

Please see www.moodys.com for any updates on changes to the lead rating analyst and to the Moody's legal entity that has issued the rating.

Please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page on www.moodys.com for additional regulatory disclosures for each credit rating.

Laura Schumacher VP - Senior Credit Officer Infrastructure Finance Group Moody's Investors Service, Inc. 250 Greenwich Street New York, NY 10007 U.S.A. JOURNALISTS: 212-553-0376 SUBSCRIBERS: 212-553-1653

Jim Hempstead MD - Utilities Infrastructure Finance Group JOURNALISTS: 212-553-0376 SUBSCRIBERS: 212-553-1653

Releasing Office: Moody's Investors Service, Inc. 250 Greenwich Street New York, NY 10007 U.S.A. JOURNALISTS: 212-553-0376 SUBSCRIBERS: 212-553-1653



© 2017 Moody's Corporation, Moody's Investors Service, Inc., Moody's Analytics, Inc. and/or their licensors and affiliates (collectively, "MOODY'S"). All rights reserved.

CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, INC. AND ITS RATINGS AFFILIATES ("MIS") ARE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY INCLUDE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES. MOODY'S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL, FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS, INC. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. NEITHER CREDIT RATINGS NOR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR. MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS AND PUBLISHES MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS AND INAPPROPRIATE FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO USE MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS OR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WHEN MAKING AN INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing the Moody's publications.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY SUCH RATING OR OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds,

debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from \$1,500 to approximately \$2,500,000. MCO and MIS also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of MIS's ratings and rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold ratings from MIS and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at <a href="https://www.moodys.com">www.moodys.com</a> under the heading "Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."

Additional terms for Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail investors. It would be reckless and inappropriate for retail investors to use MOODY'S credit ratings or publications when making an investment decision. If in doubt you should contact your financial or other professional adviser.

Additional terms for Japan only: Moody's Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.

MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY200,000 to approximately JPY350,000,000.

MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.